January 14, 2019

David Bernhardt
Acting Secretary
U.S. Department of the Interior
1849 C St. NW
Washington, D.C. 20240


Dear Acting Secretary Bernhardt:

On December 28, 2018, the U.S. Department of the Interior proposed significant, expansive, and novel revisions to its Freedom of Information Act regulations that appear to undermine government transparency, defy the Freedom of Information Act, and erode the public’s trust in the Department. See 83 Fed. Reg. 67,175 (Dec. 28, 2018). Worse, the proposed revisions have come amid a government shutdown, the holiday season, and a time of immense transition within the Interior Department with Secretary Zinke’s departure.

In light of these considerations, we request that Interior provide at least 120 days for the public to submit comments, with the 120-day comment period beginning when the government shutdown is resolved.\(^1\) We further request that the Interior Department hold public hearings regarding its proposed rule changes.

An extension of the public comment period and public hearings are imminently justified. In light of the government shutdown, which began on December 21, 2018, there are currently no Interior Department staff available to receive and review public comments. Furthermore, there is no certainty that public comment can even be submitted. Although Interior has directed the public to submit comments via the website, regulations.gov, that site indicates that “continued systems operations cannot be guaranteed.” See https://www.regulations.gov/ (accessed Jan. 2, 2019). Although the public can mail comments, we have grave concern that Interior is likely to misplace mailed comments that are stockpiled during the shutdown.

---

\(^1\) At a minimum, we request the Department of Interior provide an additional 60 days for the public to comment on this complex rulemaking, which has the potential for limiting and adversely impacting important public rights under FOIA. Under similar circumstances, the Department of Interior has generally provided at least its “usual 60 days” for comments, and regularly grants requests for an extension time for comments. See e.g., Application and Permit Information Requirements; Permit Eligibility; Definitions of Ownership and Control; the Applicant/Violator System; Alternative Enforcement Actions, 63 Fed. Reg. 70,580 (Mar. 21, 1998) (providing the “usual 60 days”). Indeed, in its 2016 revision of the FOIA regulations, the Department provided 60 days for comment. Freedom of Information Act Regulations, 81 Fed. Reg. 11,124 (Mar. 3 2016); see also Resource Management Planning, 81 FR 89580-01 (Dec. 12, 2016) (90 day formal comment period); Waste Prevention, Production Subject to Royalties, and Resource Conservation, 81 Fed. Reg. 19,110 (Apr. 4, 2016) (60 days); Waste Prevention, Production Subject to Royalties, and Resource Conservation; Rescission or Revision of Certain Requirements, 83 Fed. Reg. 49,184 (Sept. 28, 2018) (60 days).
Additionally, given the shutdown, the public currently has no opportunity to gain a more robust understanding of Interior’s proposal in order to provide informed and meaningful comments. There are no Interior staff currently available to answer questions regarding the proposed revisions. Although the proposal indicates that the public can contact Ms. Cindy Carfaro with the Office of Executive Secretariat for further information, Ms. Carfaro is not currently available due to the shutdown. What’s more, although organizations have submitted Freedom of Information Act requests to obtain more background records regarding the proposed revisions, the Interior Department is not currently accepting Freedom of Information Act requests.

Finally, given the nature of Interior’s proposed revisions, an extension and an opportunity to engage in public hearings is fully warranted. Interior is proposing revisions to its Freedom of Information Act regulations that appear to stretch beyond what any other federal agency has ever adopted or proposed in direct circumvention of the Act’s purpose. Interior is proposing revisions that would allow it to deny Freedom of Information Act requests that may require what it calls “unreasonably burdensome” searches, to more easily deny fee waiver requests, and to delay providing responsive records. Such revisions are without precedent and diverge significantly from the Department’s current regulations and the Freedom of Information Act itself.

Given the circumstances and the gravity of Interior’s unprecedented proposed rule changes, an extension of the public comment period and public hearings is warranted.

We request the Department of the Interior acknowledge receipt of this letter as soon as possible and provide a written response to our requests. Thank you in advance for considering this request.

Sincerely,

Jeremy Nichols  
Climate and Energy Program Director  
WildEarth Guardians  
2590 Walnut St.  
Denver, CO 80205  
(303) 437-7663  
jnichols@wildearthguardians.org

Margaret E. Townsend  
Open Government Staff Attorney  
Center for Biological Diversity  
225 N. Killingsworth St.  
Portland, OR 97217  
(971) 717-6409  
mtownsend@biologicaldiversity.org

Joshua Smith  
Senior Staff Attorney  
Sierra Club Environmental Law Program  
2101 Webster St., Suite 1300  
Oakland, CA 94612  
(415) 977-5560  
joshua.smith@sierraclub.org

Adam Carlesco  
Staff Attorney, Climate and Energy  
Food and Water Watch  
1616 P St. NW, Suite 310  
Washington, D.C. 20036  
(202) 683-4925  
acarlesco@fwwatch.org
Alison Flint  
Litigation Manager and Senior Policy Analyst  
The Wilderness Society  
1660 Wynkoop, Suite 850  
Denver, CO 80202  
(303) 802-1404  
alison_flint@tws.org

Wendy Jacobs  
Emmett Clinical Professor of Environmental Law  
Harvard Law School Emmett Environmental Law and Policy Clinic  
Harvard Law School, WCC Suite 4119  
(617) 496-3368  
wjacobs@law.harvard.edu

Yvonne Chi  
Attorney  
Earthjustice  
633 17th St., Suite 1600  
Denver, CO 80205  
(503) 295-0490  
vchi@earthjustice.org

Nina Bell  
Executive Director  
Northwest Environmental Advocates  
P.O. Box 12187  
Portland, OR 97212  
(503) 295-0490  
nbell@advocates-nwea.org

Nicole Ghio  
Senior Fossil Fuels Program Manager  
Friends of the Earth US  
2150 Allston Way  
Berkeley, CA 94704  
(510) 900-8064  
nghio@foe.org

Kevin Hugh Bell  
Staff Counsel  
Public Employees for Environmental Responsibility  
962 Wayne Ave.  
Silver Spring, MD 20910  
(240) 247-0298  
kbell@peer.org

Yogin Kothari  
Senior Manager of Government Affairs  
Union of Concerned Scientists  
1825 K Street NW  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
ykothari@ucsusa.org

Natalie Levine  
Program Manager, Park Resource Protection  
National Parks Conservation Association  
777 6th St NW, Suite 700  
Washington, DC 20001  
(202) 660-2059  
nlevine@npca.org

Kym Hunter  
Senior Attorney  
Southern Environmental Law Center  
601 West Rosemary Street  
Chapel Hill, NC 27516  
(919) 967-1450  
khunter@selcnc.org

Dana Johnson  
Staff Attorney  
Wilderness Watch  
P.O. Box 9623  
Moscow, ID 83843  
(208) 310-7003  
danajohnson@wildernesswatch.org
Sarah Lamdan & Rebecca Bratspies
Professors
Center for Urban and Environmental Reform (CUER)
CUNY School of Law
sarah.lamdan@law.cuny.edu

Mark Salvo
Vice President, Landscape Conservation
Defenders of Wildlife
1130 17th Street NW
Washington DC 20036
msalvo@defenders.org

Lori Andresen
President
Save Our Sky Blue Waters
PO Box 3661
Duluth, MN 55803
(218) 340-2451
andres01@charter.net

Mike Garrity
Executive Director
Alliance for the Wild Rockies
P.O. Box 505
Helena, MT 59624
(406) 459-5936
Wildrockies@gmail.com

Gary Macfarlane
Ecosystem Defense Director
Friends of the Clearwater
PO Box 9241
Moscow, ID 83843
(208) 882-9755
gary@friendsoftheclearwater.org

Sam Kalen
Professor of Law
University of Wyoming College of Law
(Affiliation Purposes Only)
Laramie, Wyoming 82071
skalen@uwyo.edu

Zygmunt Plater
Prof. Of Law
Boston College Law School ( for ID only)
885 Centre St. Newton centre MA 02459
(617) 552-4387
Plater@bc.edu

Keith Hammer
Chair
Swan View Coalition
3165 Foothill Road
Kalispell, MT 59901
keith@swanview.org

Matt Sandler
Staff Attorney
Rocky Mountain Wild
1536 Wynkoop, Suite 900
Denver, CO 80202
(303) 579-5162
matt@rockymountainwild.org

Kelly Nokes
Staff Attorney
Western Environmental Law Center
208 Paseo del Pueblo Sur, No. 602
Taos, NM 87571
(575) 6138051
nokes@westernlaw.org

Sara Colangelo
Director of the Environmental Law & Policy Program; Visiting Professor of Law
Georgetown University Law Center
600 New Jersey Ave, NW
Washington DC 20001
(202) 661-6543
sac54@law.georgetown.edu

Victoria Clark
Executive Director
Trustees for Alaska
1026 W 4th Ave., Suite 201
Anchorage, AK 99501
(907) 433-2010
vclark@trustees.org
Stephen Bloch  
Legal Director  
Southern Utah Wilderness Alliance  
425 East 100 South  
Salt Lake City, Utah 84111  
(801) 486-3161  
steve@suwa.org

Katharine K DuVivier  
Professor  
University of Denver  
2255 East Evans Avenue  
Denver, CO 80208  
(303) 871-6281  
kkduvivier@law.du.edu

Johanna Hamburger  
Wildlife Attorney  
Animal Welfare Institute  
900 Pennsylvania Ave, SE  
Washington, DC 20003  
johanna@awionline.org

Dana Bove  
Vice President  
Front Range Nesting Bald Eagle Studies  
1935 Tincup Court  
Boulder, CO 80305  
(303) 862-5524  
erintoes@comcast.net

Natasha Leger  
Executive Director  
Citizens for a Healthy Community  
PO Box 1283  
Paonia, CO 81428  
(970) 399-9700  
natasha@chc4you.org

Annecoos Wiersema  
Professor of Law  
University of Denver Sturm College of Law  
2255 E Evans Avenue  
Denver, CO 80208  
awiersema@law.du.edu

Denise Boggs  
Director  
Conservation Congress  
Billings, MT  
Denise@conservationcongress-ca.org

Kevin Emmerich  
Co- Founder  
Basin and Range Watch  
Box 70  
Beatty, Nevada, 89003  
(775) 553-2806  
atomicquailranch@gmail.com

Shaleas Harrison  
Public Land Policy Specialist  
Wyoming Wilderness Association  
44 S. Main Street  
Sheridan, WY 82801  
(307) 272-7136  
shaleas@wildwyo.org

Larry Campbell  
Conservation Director  
Friends of the Bitterroot  
PO Box, 442  
Hamilton, MT 59840  
(406) 821-3110  
lcampbell@bitterroot.net

Troy Redding  
Community Organizer  
Western Colorado Alliance  
134 N 6th St.  
Grand Junction, CO 81501  
(970) 812 2111  
troy@westerncoloradoalliance.org

Jennifer Best  
Assistant Legal Director  
Friends of Animals  
7500 E Arapahoe Rd., Ste. 385  
Centennial, CO  
(720) 949-7790  
Jennifer@friendsofanimals.org
Irma Russell  
Professor  
University of Missouri-Kansas City  
500 E. 52nd Street  
Kansas City, MO 64110  
(406) 493-2139  
russelli@umkc.edu

Margaret Bowman  
Assistant Professor  
University of Tulsa  
4th Place  
Tulsa, OK 74104  
(918) 631-2450  
wmb1339@utulsa.edu

Ben Levitan  
Attorney  
Environmental Defense Fund  
1875 Connecticut Ave., N.W. Suite 600  
Washington, DC 20009  
(202) 572-3318  
blevitan@edf.org

Alejandro Camacho  
Professor of Law and Director, Center for Land, Environment, and Natural Resources  
University of California, Irvine School of Law  
401 East Peltason Drive, Law 4500-A  
Irvine, CA 92697-8000  
(949) 824 4160  
acamacho@law.uci.edu

Patrick Llewellyn  
Attorney  
Public Citizen  
1600 20th Street NW  
Washington, DC 20009  
plewellyn@citizen.org

Joel A. Mintz  
Professor Emeritus and C. William Trout Senior Fellow  
Nova Southeastern University College of Law  
3305 College Avenue  
Davie, FL 33314  
(954) 262-6160  
mintzj@nova.edu

Cyndi Tuell  
Tuell Consulting  
903 N. Alder  
Tucson, AZ 85705  
cyndi@tuellconsulting.com

Julia Page  
Acting Oil & Gas Team Chair  
Idaho Organization of Resource Councils  
910 W. Main Street  
Boise, ID 83702  
(208) 991-4451  
dpaddock@IORCinfo.org

Peter Hart  
Staff Attorney  
Wilderness Workshop  
Box 1442  
Carbondale, CO 81623  
(970) 963-3977  
peter@wildernessworkshop.org

Patrice McDermott  
Director  
Government Information Watch  
1103 Fairview Court  
Silver Spring, MD 20910  
pmcdermott@govinfowatch.net
Sara Kendall  
Program Director  
Western Organization of Resource Councils  
220 South 27th St.  
Billings, MT 59101  
(202) 680-3538  
sara@worc.org

Vivian Stockman  
Interim Executive Director  
Ohio Valley Environmental Council  
PO Box 6753  
Huntington, WV 25773  
(304) 522-0246  
vivian@ohvec.org

Ted Boettner  
Executive Director  
WV Center on Budget and Policy  
8 Capitol Street  
Charleston, WV 25301  
(304) 720-8682  
tboettner@wvpolicy.org

Lore Rosenthal  
Program Coordinator  
Greenbelt Climate Action Network  
2-R Gardenway  
Greenbelt, MD 20770  
(301) 345-2234  
simplicitygroupsmd@gmail.com

David Sligh  
Conservation Director  
Wild Virginia  
1433 Wickham Pond Drive  
Charlottesville, VA 22902  
(434) 964-7455  
david@wildvirginia.org

Rebecca Roter  
Chairperson  
Breathe Easy Susquehanna County  
PO Box 98  
Montrose PA 18801  
(267) 733-5211  
Aludra@aol.com

Irene Leech  
President  
Virginia Citizens Consumer Council  
4220 North Fork Rd  
Elliston, VA 24087  
vaconsumeradvocate@gmail.com

Jim Anderson  
President  
Peace Action New York State  
64 Fulton St  
Manhattan, NY 10038  
Peaceactionjim@gmail.com

Barbara Adams  
Richmond Interfaith Climate Justice  
5100 Montebello Circle  
Richmond, VA 23231  
barb5100@comcast.net  
(804) 484-2773

Georgina Shanley  
Co-Founder  
Citizens United for Renewable Energy  
Ocean City, NJ  
Georginashanley@gmail.com

Larry V Thomas  
President  
West Virginia Highlands Conservancy  
P. O. Box 306  
Charleston, WV 25321  
(304) 567-2602  
larryvthomas@aol.com

Eric Engle  
Chairman  
Mid-Ohio Valley Climate Action  
3850 Central Avenue Apt. 4  
Parkersburg, WV 26104  
(304) 488-4384  
ericengle85@yahoo.com
Aaron Mintzes
Senior Policy Counsel
Earthworks
1612 K Street, N.W. Suite 904 Washington, DC 20006
amintzes@earthworks.org

J. Stephen Cleghorn, PhD
Owner
Paradise Gardens and Farm
2771 Paradise Road
(814) 932-6761
jstephencleghorn@yahoo.com

Andrea Miller
Executive Director
PeopleDemandingAction
18459 Patriot Ln.
Ruther Glen, VA 22546
(443) 878-2071
andrea@peopledemandingaction.org

Peter Hudiburg
Founder
PlymouthFriendsforCleanWater
P.O. Box 61
(607) 334-2986
hudiburg@frontiernet.net

Freemanhobs Allan
Veteran's Service Corps
1394 Blair Park Road
Crozet, VA 22932
(434) 409-8666
FreemanHobs@gmail.com

Carol Davis
Coordinator
Diné C.A.R.E.
HCR 63 Box 272
Dilkon, AZ 86047
(928) 679-5045
Carol.davis@dine-care.org

John Weisheit
Conservation Director
LivingRivers&ColoradoRiverkeeper
PO Box 466
Moab, UT 84532
(435) 259-1063
john@livingrivers.org

George Billard
Co-Founder
SCRAM
PO Box 192
Eldred, NY 12732
info@nyscram.org

Howdy Henritz
President
IndianCreekWatershedAssociation
PO Box 711
Union, WV 24983
(304) 716-6760
indiancreekwater@gmail.com

Vernon Haltom
Executive Director
CoalRiverMountainWatch
P.O. Box 303
Naoma, WV 25140
Vernon@crmw.net

Carole Marner
Delaware Solidarity
29 Water Street
Franklin, NY 13775
(607) 829-8451
carolemarner@frontier.net

E. Louis Priem, MD
SustainableOtsego
276 VanYahres Rd
Cooperstown, NY 13326
copbirc@hughes.net
Chad Oba  
President  
Friends of Buckingham  
571 Woods Rd Buckingham 23921  
(434) 806-6332  
chado108@me.com  

Dr Bob Allen  
Co-chair  
Don't Gas the Pinelands Coalition  
Seaville, NJ  
allwestc@aol.com  

Jen Hilburn  
Executive Director  
Altamaha Riverkeeper  
PO Box 4122  
Macon, GA  
(912) 441-3908  
Jen@altamahariverkeeper.org  

Yvonne Taylor  
Vice President  
Gas Free Seneca  
PO Box 333  
Watkins Glen NY 14891  
(607) 342-1278  
gasfreesenecagirl@gmail.com  

Patti Wood  
Executive Director  
Grassroots Environmental Education  
52 Main Street,  
Port Washington, NY 11050  
(914) 422-3141  
ellen@grassrootsinfo.org  

Joseph Campbell  
President  
Seneca Lake Guardian  
PO Box 333  
Watkins Glen NY 14891  
(607) 769-4639  
muchado2@gmail.com  

Steve Ellsworth  
Board Member  
Sustainable McDonough  
850 Hammerle Rd.  
Oxford, NY 13830  
(607) 647-9321  
steve.ellsworth2gmail.com  

Marie McRae  
spokesperson  
Dryden Resource Awareness Coalition  
Dryden NY  
mmmcræ@juno.com  

Cc: Executive Secretariat, U.S. Department of the Interior